The Gaon of Vilna, the Ḥatam Sofer, and the Ḥazon Ish: Minhag and the Crisis of Modernity

By: BENJAMIN BROWN

Translated from the original Hebrew by Btzalel E. Shandelman in close collaboration with the author.*+

We have seen that from the 1930's to the 1950's at least, the position of the Hazon Ish remained consistent and unyielding: A *minhag* has no

* Excerpted from Benjamin Brown, *The Ḥazon Ish: Halakhist, Believer, and Leader of the Ḥaredi Revolution*, (Jerusalem: Hebrew University Magnes Press, 2011) pp. 460-469. Published here in *Ḥakirah* with the kind permission of the author and Hebrew University Magnes Press.

+ Devarim Vehoraot = R. Meir Greiniman, Kuntres Devarim Vehoraot Mimaran ZLLHH, at the end of his book Imrei Yosher, Bnei Brak 1973.

Dinim Vehanhagot = R. Meir Greiniman, Likkut Dinim Vehanhagot Mimaran Ha hazon Ish ZLLHH, Bnei Brak 1996.

Ḥazon Ish = R. Avaraham Yesha 'yahu Karelitz, *Ḥazon Ish* [on talmudic tractates and sections of the *Shulhan 'Arukh*], Bnei Brak 1994.

Kovetz Iggrot = R. Avraham Yesha'yahu Karelitz (R. Shmuel Greiniman, ed), Kovetz Iggrot Maran Hahazon Ish ZLLHH (1-3), Bnei Brak 1990.

Orhot Ish = R. Shemaryahu Greiniman, Orhot Ish—Peninim Ugenazim, 1st edition, Jerusalem 1989.

Teshuvot Ukhtavim = R. Avraham Yesha'yahu Karelitz (R. Meir Greiniman, ed.), Teshuvot Ukhtavim Mimaran Ḥahazon Ish (Orah Ḥayim, Zera'im, Kodashim), Bnei Brak 1991.

Benjamin Brown is Professor of Jewish Thought at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem and a researcher at the Israel Democracy Institute. His main focus is Orthodox Judaism, which he studies in a variety of aspects: Jewish Law (Halakhah), Hasidism, the Musar Movement, and Haredi ideology (Hashkafah). He has published many articles on these topics, and his book The Hazon Ish: Halakhist, Believer and Leader of the Haredi Revolution (2011), from which this article is excerpted, analyzes the chief "founding father" of the Israeli Haredi community.

Btzalel (Todd) Shandelman, whose primary occupation is software engineering, is also a professional translator of Hebrew and Russian. He currently lives in Houston, Texas, with his wife and son.